

# OPEN ACCESS

**Citation:** Simba D, Kakoko D, Semali I, Kessy A, Embrey M (2016) Household Knowledge of Antimicrobials and Antimicrobial Resistance in the Wake of an Accredited Drug Dispensing Outlet (ADD0) Program Rollout in Tanzania. PLoS ONE 11(9): e0163246. doi:10.1371/journal. pone.0163246

Editor: Patrick Butaye, Ross University School of Veterinary Medicine, SAINT KITTS AND NEVIS

Received: December 29, 2015

Accepted: September 5, 2016

Published: September 29, 2016

**Copyright:** © 2016 Simba et al. This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

**Data Availability Statement:** All relevant data are within the paper and its Supporting Information files.

Funding: The study on which this manuscript is based was funded by the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation through a grant to Management Sciences for Health (MSH) (URL: http://www.msh. org/), #OPP1017439, who, in turn subcontracted with MUHAS (#SDSI-2012-17). MSH employees, Dr. Edmund Rutta, Mr. Keith Johnson, Dr. Suleiman Kimatta, and Mr. Jafary Liana were **RESEARCH ARTICLE** 

# Household Knowledge of Antimicrobials and Antimicrobial Resistance in the Wake of an Accredited Drug Dispensing Outlet (ADDO) Program Rollout in Tanzania

Daudi Simba<sup>1</sup>\*, Deodatus Kakoko<sup>2</sup>, Innocent Semali<sup>3</sup>, Anna Kessy<sup>1</sup>, Martha Embrey<sup>4</sup>

1 Department of Community Health, School of Public Health and Social Sciences, Muhimbili University of Health and Allied Sciences, P.O. Box 65015, Dar-es-Salaam, Tanzania, 2 Department of Behavioural Sciences, School of Public Health and Social Sciences, Muhimbili University of Health and Allied Sciences, P.O. Box 65015, Dar-es-Salaam, Tanzania, 3 Department of Epidemiology and Biostatistics, School of Public Health and Social Sciences, Muhimbili University of Health and Allied Sciences, P.O. Box 65015, Dares-Salaam, Tanzania, 4 Management Sciences for Health, Arlington, VA, United States of America

\* daudisimba@yahoo.com

# Abstract

#### Introduction

Private sector drug shops are an important source of medicines in Tanzania. In 2003, the government introduced the accredited drug dispensing outlet (ADDO) program to improve access to good-quality medicines in rural and peri-urban areas that have frequent drug shortages in public health facilities and few or no registered pharmacies. However, increasing access may also contribute to antimicrobial resistance (AMR) due to the potential over-use and misuse of drugs.

#### Methods

We conducted a cross-sectional household survey in four regions in mainland Tanzaniato characterize consumer care-seeking habits and medicines use and to determine the extent to which members of the community are knowledgeable about antimicrobials and AMR. Within the regions, we applied a multistage cluster sampling design, cascading from districts, wards, and villages to households. Multivariate logistic analysis was done to determine variables influencing knowledge of antimicrobials and AMR, while controlling for confounding factors. Variables included age, occupation, level of education, membership in an insurance scheme, and wealth status.

#### **Results and Discussion**

We revealed that communities in four Tanzanian regions have low levels of knowledge of the concepts of antimicrobials and their use and AMR. Level of public understanding rose with wealth status and education. Only one-third of 1,200 respondents (33.6%) had ever heard of a medicine called an antimicrobial, and 5–15% could name at least one antimicrobial spontaneously. Some thought other medicines, such as paracetamol were



involved as technical advisors in the design of the study and provided logistics support during data collection and advice during data analysis. The Gates Foundation had no input into the study design, data collection, analysis or the preparation of the manuscript. MSH provided MUHAS unrestricted access to the data.

**Competing Interests:** The authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

antimicrobial (7.5%). People were equally likely to agree that pneumonia should be treated with an antimicrobial (21.4%) as well as common cold (28.4%). Understanding of AMR risks was better, particularly related to HIV and AIDS (32.2%) and malaria (38.6%)—most likely due to information campaigns focused on those two diseases. The level of knowledge decreased the further away respondents lived from an ADDO (p = 0.0001) and where ADDO density was lower (p = 0.001), which supports the use of ADDO dispensers as sources of community information and change agents for more appropriate medicine use.

#### Conclusion

Lack of knowledge about antimicrobials and AMR in Tanzanian communities needs to be addressed through multi-pronged strategies that focus on prescribers and the public—especially those who are poorer and less educated.

### Introduction

Efforts to control infectious diseases are challenged by the emergence of antimicrobial resistance (AMR) that has been increasing globally, with the primary contributors being overuse and misuse of antimicrobials[1,2]. AMR also places financial burden on countries with weak economies due to the higher costs of alternative antimicrobials [3]. In addition, alternative treatments are often more toxic and associated with more and serious adverse events [4].

In the last decades, the World Health Organization (WHO) has spearheaded global efforts to control the emergence of AMR by advocating for using medicines appropriately. Rational medicine use relies on prescribers and patients whose attitudes toward antimicrobial use drive their behaviors. While prescribers play a major role in ensuring the right medicine is given for the right disease in the right dose and duration, patients also have to adhere to the prescriptions.

The privatesector is acknowledged as an important source of medicines in many countries, including Tanzania [5,6].In an effort to improve the quality of pharmaceutical products and services in the private sector, in 2003, Tanzania introduced the accredited drug dispensing outlet (ADDO) program, which combined owner and dispenser training, government accreditation based on standards, business incentives, and local regulatory enforcement, with efforts to increase consumer demand for quality products and services. The program was begun with the goal of improving access to good-quality medicines in rural and peri-urban areas that have frequent drug shortages in public health facilities and few or no registered pharmacies.

To date, the program has been rolled out throughout the country with more than9,000 ADDOs established and 19,000 dispensers trained [7]. Dispenser training covers topics such as diagnosis and management of common conditions, patient counseling, and referral to a health care facility. After meeting the accreditation standards, dispensers are allowed to dispense, some prescription-only medicines, including selected antimicrobials that are on a list approved and issued by the Ministry of Health and Social Welfare. While this flexibility is aimed at improving access to antimicrobials in underserved areas, it may also contribute to AMR due to the potential overuse and misuse of drugs, which are beyond the control of regulatory enforcement efforts [8].

This household survey was part of a multi-method assessment to explore the different components that contribute to antimicrobial access and use in Tanzania with a focus on ADDOs. The purpose of the household survey was to characterize consumer care-seeking habits and medicines use and to determine the extent to which members of the community are knowledgeable about antimicrobials and AMR. Other parts of the study used interviews with patients leaving health facilities to uncover health facility prescribing and dispensing practices, a mystery shopper exercise to determine ADDO dispensing practices, and audits of ADDOs and health facilities to evaluate the availability and prices of antimicrobials. Results from other parts of the study have been published elsewhere [9,10].

# Methods

# Study Setting

Tanzania's mainland has 947,300 square kilometers with 43,625,354 inhabitants located in 25 regions with populations ranging from 1.1 to 3.5 million people. A region consists of four to eight districts, with the population in each district ranging from 150,000 to 450,000 in rural areas and up to one million in some urban areas[11]. The districts are divided into wards that are further sub-divided into villages (rural areas) or streets (urban settings).

The health system is a pyramid with a narrow apex comprised of one national and three zonal consultant hospitals and a broad base made up of 5,657 dispensaries providing care at village level,653 health centers at the ward level, and one hospital in each district. Services are decentralized, and thus, district councils are responsible for overseeing their respective dispensaries, health centers, and hospital. About half of the health facilities are owned by the government, while the remaining half are run by nongovernmental, private for-profit, or religious organizations. Some wards have many ADDOs (high density) while others have few (low density) or none.

# Study Design and Sampling Procedure

We conducted this cross-sectional study in four regions of Tanzania's mainland: Mbeya, Morogoro, Tanga, and Singida. Selection of the four regions was purposive, based on geographical location, wealth status, and the length of time that the ADDO program had been implemented. Morogoro represented the eastern regions and had more than five years of experience in implementing ADDOs. Tanga region represented the northern regions, and the program had been operational for about two years. Mbeya region was selected to represent the southern highlands and had had ADDOs for about three years. It also has a relatively high wealth status compared to the other selected regions. Singida represented the central regions, and at the time of the study, had been implementing the ADDO program for less than one year; it has a relatively low wealth status compared to the other selected regions. We aimed to reach a sample of 1,200 households. Calculation of the sample size assumed a 95% confidence interval (CI), a nonresponse rate of 10%, and a design effect of 2.0.

Within the regions, we applied a multistage cluster sampling design, cascading from districts, wards, and villages to households as illustrated in Fig\_1.

# **Data Collection Procedures**

We recruited a team of 20 research assistants and trained them on the research objectives, field work procedures, and the use of electronic tablets to capture data. The team participated in a two-day pilot study in Coast region to consolidate field experiences and identify and respond to logistical challenges with conducting the actual survey.

A village guide introduced the data collector to a household member, and together they identified an appropriate respondent, defined as a member of the household who was most informed about the health status and access to health care of the other members. The respondent was interviewed after signing an informed consent form.



Fig 1. Sampling design.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0163246.g001

We adapted to local context the WHO household survey on medicine access and use[12] and an AMR population-based questionnaire used in Demographic and Health Surveys<sup>[13]</sup> (S1. Questionnaire). The resulting questionnaire contained 40 questions related to general information about the household, access to health care services, and knowledge of antimicrobials and AMR. We used the questionnaire to establish knowledge on four main study questions: First, respondents were asked if they were aware of antibiotics. Those who responded affirmatively were asked to mention the names of some antibiotics they knew. Responses were recorded as "spontaneous" (for those who mentioned names without probing); "after probing" using a list of medicines that included both antibiotics and non-antibiotics; and "don't know." Respondents were asked to mention illnesses in which antibiotics were useful. Then, the interviewers defined what AMR means as follows, "Some medicines that used to work in the past for fighting infections are no longer working. This problem is called drug resistance."The interviewers asked the respondents if they had ever heard of the problem. The interviewers mentioned a list of acute illnesses to test respondents' knowledge of illnesses in which serious treatment resistance has been reported. Finally, the interviewers further probed on knowledge of factors that contribute to resistance by reading to them a number of correct and incorrect options.

#### Data Management and Analyses

The electronic tablet software used for data collection had been formatted to check inconsistencies, skipping patterns, and outliers. Daily, the data collection supervisor copied data from research assistants and checked for errors and inconsistencies prior to uploading it to a central server via the Internet. Data was then transferred to STATA version 10.0 (Stata Corp., College Station, TX, USA) for analysis (S1 and S2 Data).

Analyses involved the calculation of frequencies and cross-tabulations to identify associations. We measured strength of association using chi-square tests and Fisher exact tests (for tables with cells that had a value of less than 5);p-values lower than 0.05 were considered significant. Logistic regression was used in multivariate analyses to calculate crude odds ratios (OR), adjusted OR (AOR) in multivariate analysis, and the respective 95% CI.

Each of the four study questions had a range of four to seven correct responses. A score was assigned for each correct response as follows:

Question 1: Please mention the names of some antibiotics that you know. This question had seven correct responses. A score was assigned if a response was given spontaneously.

Question 2: For which of the following illnesses or conditions are antibiotics useful? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree). The question had seven correct responses. Although the question was specifically about antibiotics, respondents could include antimicrobials that are not antibiotics (since differentiating the two requires expert knowledge) [14]. For this reason, during analyses, we treated all antimicrobials as correct responses.

Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree). This had four correct responses.

Question 4: Can you tell me whether each of the following can contribute to causing resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree). This had six correct responses.

We measured knowledge of antimicrobials by adding the sum score of correct responses from the first question; scores of 0 indicated low knowledge, while scores of one and above indicated high knowledge. We measured knowledge of AMR by adding the sum score of correct responses from questions 3 and 4. Respondents scoring 0 were labeled as having no knowledge; those scoring from 1 to 8 were labeled with some knowledge; and those with scores of 9 and 10 had good knowledge.

We measured wealth status using asset ownership based on a list adopted from the Demographic Health Survey [15].Principal component analysis was used to create a wealth index that categorized households into wealth quartiles. Items owned or not owned by less than 10% were excluded. Excluded items were vehicles, tractors, power-tillers, electric kettles, microwaves, and toilets.

Multivariate logistic analysis was done to determine variables influencing knowledge of antimicrobials and AMR, while controlling for confounding factors at a level of significance of pvalue <0.1. We used a step-wise approach to enter variables into the model until attaining the highest regression coefficient. The variables were age, occupation, level of education, membership in an insurance scheme, and wealth status.

#### Ethical Clearance/Considerations

The study was granted ethical clearance from Muhimbili University of Health and Allied Sciences Institutional Review Board and the National Institute for Medical Research. We presented letters of introduction to regional and district leaders and delivered similar letters from the districts to ward and village leaders whom we briefed on the project objectives. The data collectors asked the selected household respondents to give signed consent, and only those who consented were interviewed. If the respondent declined to be interviewed, the research assistant moved to the next household.

#### Results

In this study, we assessed respondents' awareness and knowledge about antimicrobials and antimicrobial resistance. About one-third of the respondents (33.7%) reported being awareness on antimicrobials (Table 1). Awareness of antimicrobials decrease significantly with ADDO density, from 41.8% in the high-density areas to 19.7% in the areas without ADDOs (p = 0.001). Although awareness of antimicrobials did not vary significantly across regions, respondents residing closer to an ADDO (<5kms) were more likely to be aware of antimicrobials compared to their counterparts living farther away from an ADDO (38.9% and 20.7%, respectively, p = 0.0001).

When respondents who had heard of antimicrobialswere asked to mention any antimicrobialthey knew, the proportion mentioning a correct antimicrobial spontaneously was quite low, ranging from 4.9% for sulfadoxine-pyrimethamine to 15.2% for amoxicillin (Table 2 Question

Table 1. Awareness of antimicrobials as a type of medicine by region, ADDO density, and distance from ADDO.

Factor	N	Not aware (%) (n = 796)	Aware (%)(n = 404)	P-value
Region				
Mbeya	300	68.3	31.7	0.285
Morogoro	300	62.7	37.3	
Singida	300	69.3	30.7	
Tanga	300	65.0	35.0	
ADDO density				
High	569	58.2	41.8	0.001
Low	453	71.1	28.9	
None	178	80.3	19.7	
Distance from ADDO				
<5kms	857	61.1	38.9	0.0001
>5kms	343	79.3	20.7	

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0163246.t001

Question 1: Please mention the names of some antibiotics that you know	Mentio sponta	oned aneously
	N	(%)
Amoxicillin*	182	15.2
Tetracycline*	110	9.2
Cotrimoxazole*	103	8.6
Paracetamol	90	7.5
Metronidazole*	81	6.8
Artemether-lumefantrine*	80	6.7
Penicillin*	71	5.9
Sulfadoxine-pyrimethamine*	59	4.9
Mist expectorant sedative	34	2.8
Question 2: For which of the following illnesses or conditions are antibiotics useful? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree)	Respo	nded ye
	N	(%)
Cough, cold, and runny nose	341	28.4
Malaria*	318	26.5
Diarrhea with bloody stool*	273	22.8
Diarrhea with watery stool	275	22.9
Pneumonia*	257	21.4
Sexually transmitted infection*	217	18.1
Ear discharging pus, earache*	186	15.5
	100	11.0
Tuberculosis*	136	11.3
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious	136 68 <b>Respo</b>	5.7 nded ye
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree)	136 68 Respo	5.7 nded ye
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Malaria*	136 68 Respo N 463	11.3 5.7 nded ye
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Malaria* HIV/AIDS*	136           68           Respo           N           463           386	(%) 38.6
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Malaria* HIV/AIDS* Tuberculosis*	136           68           Respo           N           463           386           298	(%) 38.6 32.2 24.8
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Malaria* HIV/AIDS* Tuberculosis* Sexually transmitted infection*	136           68           Respo           N           463           386           298           271	(%) 38.6 32.2 24.8 22.6
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Malaria* HIV/AIDS* Tuberculosis* Sexually transmitted infection* Courds cold and runny nose	136           68           Respo           N           463           386           298           271           268	(%) 38.6 32.2 24.8 22.6 22.3
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Malaria* HIV/AIDS* Tuberculosis* Sexually transmitted infection* Cough, cold, and runny nose Pneumonia	N         463           298         271           268         180	(%) 38.6 32.2 24.8 22.6 22.3 15.0
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Malaria* HIV/AIDS* Tuberculosis* Sexually transmitted infection* Cough, cold, and runny nose Pneumonia Ear discharging pus_earache	N         463           386         298           271         268           180         178	(%) 38.6 32.2 24.8 22.6 22.3 15.0 14.8
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Malaria* HIV/AIDS* Tuberculosis* Sexually transmitted infection* Cough, cold, and runny nose Pneumonia Ear discharging pus, earache Diarthea with bloody stool	136         68           Respo         N           463         386           298         271           268         180           178         135	(%) 38.6 32.2 24.8 22.6 22.3 15.0 14.8 11 3
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Malaria* HIV/AIDS* Tuberculosis* Sexually transmitted infection* Cough, cold, and runny nose Pneumonia Ear discharging pus, earache Diarrhea with bloody stool Diarrhea with watery stool	136           68           Respo           N           463           386           298           271           268           180           178           135           126	11.3         5.7         nded ye         (%)         38.6         32.2         24.8         22.6         22.3         15.0         14.8         11.3         10 5
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Malaria* HIV/AIDS* Tuberculosis* Sexually transmitted infection* Cough, cold, and runny nose Pneumonia Ear discharging pus, earache Diarrhea with bloody stool Diarrhea with watery stool Question 4: Can you tell me whether each of the following can contribute to causing resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree)	136         68           Respo         N           463         386           298         271           268         180           178         135           126         Respo	11.3         5.7         nded ye         (%)         38.6         32.2         24.8         22.6         22.3         15.0         14.8         11.3         10.5         nded ye
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Malaria* HIV/AIDS* Tuberculosis* Sexually transmitted infection* Cough, cold, and runny nose Pneumonia Ear discharging pus, earache Diarrhea with bloody stool Diarrhea with watery stool Question 4: Can you tell me whether each of the following can contribute to causing resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree)	136           68           Respo           N           463           386           298           271           268           180           178           135           126           Respo           N	11.3         5.7         nded ye         38.6         32.2         24.8         22.6         22.3         15.0         14.8         11.3         10.5         nded ye         (%)
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Malaria* HIV/AIDS* Tuberculosis* Sexually transmitted infection* Cough, cold, and runny nose Pneumonia Ear discharging pus, earache Diarrhea with bloody stool Diarrhea with bloody stool Diarrhea with watery stool Question 4: Can you tell me whether each of the following can contribute to causing resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Taking medicines that have been kept at home for a long time*	136           68           Respo           N           463           386           298           271           268           180           178           135           126           Respo           N           550	11.3         5.7         nded ye         (%)         38.6         32.2         24.8         22.6         22.3         15.0         14.8         11.3         10.5         nded ye         (%)         45.8
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Malaria* HIV/AIDS* Tuberculosis* Sexually transmitted infection* Cough, cold, and runny nose Pneumonia Ear discharging pus, earache Diarrhea with bloody stool Diarrhea with bloody stool Diarrhea with watery stool Question 4: Can you tell me whether each of the following can contribute to causing resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Taking medicines that have been kept at home for a long time* Stopping taking medicine before finishing the treatment duration*	136         68         Respo         N         463         386         298         271         268         180         178         135         126         Respo         N         550         537	11.3         5.7         nded ye         (%)         38.6         32.2         24.8         22.6         22.3         15.0         14.8         11.3         10.5         nded ye         (%)         45.8         44.8
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Malaria* HIV/AIDS* Tuberculosis* Sexually transmitted infection* Cough, cold, and runny nose Pneumonia Ear discharging pus, earache Diarrhea with bloody stool Diarrhea with watery stool Question 4: Can you tell me whether each of the following can contribute to causing resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Taking medicines that have been kept at home for a long time* Stopping taking medicine before finishing the treatment duration* Using medicines that are poorly manufactured*	136           68           Respo           N           463           386           298           271           268           180           178           135           126           Respo           N           550           537           535	11.3         5.7         nded ye         (%)         38.6         32.2         24.8         22.6         22.3         15.0         14.8         11.3         10.5         nded ye         (%)         45.8         44.8         44.6
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Malaria* HIV/AIDS* Tuberculosis* Sexually transmitted infection* Cough, cold, and runny nose Pneumonia Ear discharging pus, earache Diarrhea with bloody stool Diarrhea with bloody stool Question 4: Can you tell me whether each of the following can contribute to causing resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Taking medicines that have been kept at home for a long time* Stopping taking medicine before finishing the treatment duration* Using medicines that are poorly manufactured* Taking less of the medicine at one dose than is recommended*	136         68         Respo         N         463         386         298         271         268         180         178         135         126         Respo         N         550         537         535         529	11.3         5.7         nded ye         (%)         38.6         32.2         24.8         22.6         22.3         15.0         14.8         11.3         10.5         nded ye         (%)         45.8         44.8         44.6         44.1
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Malaria* HIV/AIDS* Tuberculosis* Sexually transmitted infection* Cough, cold, and runny nose Pneumonia Ear discharging pus, earache Diarrhea with bloody stool Diarrhea with watery stool Question 4: Can you tell me whether each of the following can contribute to causing resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Taking medicines that have been kept at home for a long time* Stopping taking medicine before finishing the treatment duration* Using medicines that are poorly manufactured* Taking less of the medicine at one dose than is recommended* Skipping doses of the medicine*	136         68         Respo         N         463         386         298         271         268         180         178         135         126         Respo         N         550         537         529         522	11.3         5.7         nded ye         (%)         38.6         32.2         24.8         22.6         22.3         15.0         14.8         11.3         10.5         nded ye         (%)         45.8         44.8         44.6         44.1         43.5
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Malaria* HIV/AIDS* Tuberculosis* Sexually transmitted infection* Cough, cold, and runny nose Pneumonia Ear discharging pus, earache Diarrhea with bloody stool Diarrhea with watery stool Question 4: Can you tell me whether each of the following can contribute to causing resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Taking medicines that have been kept at home for a long time* Stopping taking medicine before finishing the treatment duration* Using medicines that are poorly manufactured* Taking less of the medicine at one dose than is recommended	136         68         Respo         1         463         386         298         271         268         180         178         135         126         Respo         N         550         537         535         529         522         501	11.3         5.7         nded ye         38.6         32.2         24.8         22.6         22.3         15.0         14.8         11.3         10.5         nded ye         (%)         45.8         44.8         44.6         44.1         43.5         41.8
Tuberculosis* HIV/AIDS* Question 3: Can you tell me which of the following illnesses have more serious resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Malaria* HIV/AIDS* Tuberculosis* Sexually transmitted infection* Cough, cold, and runny nose Pneumonia Ear discharging pus, earache Diarrhea with bloody stool Diarrhea with watery stool Question 4: Can you tell me whether each of the following can contribute to causing resistance problems? (Interviewer mentions and respondents agree or disagree) Taking medicines that have been kept at home for a long time* Stopping taking medicine before finishing the treatment duration* Using medicines that are poorly manufactured* Taking less of the medicine at one dose than is recommended Using medicines that were prescribed for someone else*	136         68         Respo         N         463         386         298         271         268         180         178         135         126         Respo         N         550         537         535         529         521         501	11.3         5.7         nded ye         (%)         38.6         32.2         24.8         22.6         22.3         15.0         14.8         11.3         10.5         nded ye         (%)         45.8         44.6         44.1         43.5         41.8         41.8

Table 2. Responses to Questions about antimicrobials and antimicrobial resistance\*\*.

(Continued)

Table 2. (Continued)

Taking the same medicine too frequently	449	37.4
Taking medicines without eating any food	445	37.1

\*Correct response

\*\*We considered any antimicrobial to be a correct answer

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0163246.t002

1). After probing using a list of medicines, more respondents agreed that most of the medicines were antimicrobials, even if they were not; for example, 20.9% thought mist expectorant sedative was an antimicrobial.

We further explored antimicrobialsknowledge by using a list of conditions (Table 2 Question 2) to prompt respondents to agree or disagree with whether or not the illness is treatable with antimicrobials. Malaria (26.5%) and bloody diarrhea (22.8%) were the most common illnesses that respondents knew to be treatable with antimicrobials. However, an equally similar proportion of respondents erroneously agreed that antimicrobials can be used to treat watery diarrhea (22.9%) and cough and cold (28.4%).

To explore respondents' awareness of AMR in the community, we assessed their knowledge of resistance to standard treatments by prompting them using a list of specific diseases. While only one-quarter of the respondents correctly agreed that resistance to antimicrobial agents exists with sexually transmitted infections (22.6%) and tuberculosis (24.8%), about one-third agreed on AMR related to HIV/AIDS (32.2%) and malaria (38.6%) (Table 2, Question 3).

Nearly one-half of the respondents thought that stopping a medicine before finishing the prescribed treatment duration (44.8%) and also taking less of the medicine at one dose than prescribed(44.1%) contribute to AMR(Table 2). The high response rate might not actually indicate good knowledge of factors contributing to AMR because similar proportions affirmed unlikely contributors, such as taking more of the medicine at one dose (41.8%) and taking medicine without eating (37.1%).

Table 3 shows that the level of knowledge on antimicrobials was associated with the region the respondent came from (p = 0.0001), ADDO density in the respective district (p = 0.0001) and distance from household to an ADDO (p = 0.0001). A similar pattern was observed when analysis was done with knowledge on AMR.

We performed logistic analysis to establish the influence of the following factors on level of knowledge:age, occupation, level of education, membership in an insurance scheme, and wealth status. Table 4 shows that respondents in wealthier households  $(2^{nd}-4^{th}quartile)$  were five times more likely to have a higher knowledge of antimicrobials compared to those from poorer households  $(1^{st}quartile)(AOR = 3.21;CI = 3.21-7.54)$ .Respondents who completed primary education were three times more likely to have more knowledge than those with no or incomplete primary education(AOR = 3.23; CI = 2.49-4.18).We observed similar findings related to AMR knowledge, although the adjusted odds ratios were lower (AOR = 1.97; CI = 1.48-2.61 and AOR = 2.16; CI = 1.74-2.70, respectively).

#### Discussion

We revealed that communities in four Tanzanian regions had low levels of knowledge of the concepts of antimicrobials and their use and AMR. However, studies in both developed and developing countries have found similar results, with the level of public understanding generally rising with socioeconomic status and education [16–18], which we also found. In Tanzania,

	Level of kn	p-value		
Region	None	Low	High	
Mbeya	68.7	18.3	13.0	0.0001
Morogoro	64.3	27.7	8.0	
Singida	70.3	24.7	5.0	
Tanga	66.7	39.7	3.7	
ADDO density				
High	58.7	33.6	7.7	0.0001
Low	72.9	19.4	7.7	
None	82.0	12.4	5.6	
Distance from ADDO				
<5km	62.3	28.8	8.9	0.0001
≥5km	80.5	15.7	3.8	
	Level of kn	p-value		
Region	None	Low	High	
Mbeya	50.3	31.3	18.3	0.005
Morogoro	51.0	26.3	22.7	
Singida	46.7	27.3	26.0	
Tanga	57.7	29.0	13.3	
ADDO density				
High	46.4	31.8	21.8	0.01
Low	54.3	25.8	19.9	
None	60.1	24.7	15.2	
Distance from ADDO				
	49.0	20.4	22.4	0.001
<5km	48.2	29.4	22.4	0.001
<5km ≥5km	59.5	29.4	14.3	0.001

Table 3. Overall levels of knowledge of antimicrobials and AMR by region, ADDO density, and distance from an ADDO\*.

\*Levels of knowledge based on average scores on responses to questions in Table 2.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0163246.t003

a person who is economically better off is more likely to own a radio or a television and have more access to reading materials related to antimicrobials and AMR; while half of Tanzanians own a radio (55%) and only 16% own a television set [19].

Table 4. L	ogistic analysis of	factors influencing respondents	' level of knowledge of antimic	robials and AMR.
		<b>U U</b>	<b>U</b>	

Factors related to antimicrobials knowledge	OR	95% CI	AOR	95% CI
Wealth status	7.17	4.76-10.81	4.92	3.21-7.54
Education	3.75	2.94-4.79	3.23	2.49-4.18
Occupation	1.46	1.34–1.59	1.32	1.20-1.45
Age	1.21	1.02-1.44	1.57	1.28–1.93
Membership in insurance scheme	1.00	0.73–1.36	1.01	0.75–1.44
Factors related to AMR knowledge		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
Wealth status	2.43	1.86–3.18	1.97	1.48–2.61
Education	2.22	1.80-2.72	2.16	1.74-2.70
Occupation	1.13	1.04–1.23	1.03	0.95-1.13
Age	1.16	0.99–1.36	1.32	1.11–1.57
Membership in insurance scheme	1.07	0.80–1.43	1.06	0.79–1.44

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0163246.t004

In our study, few household respondents were able to spontaneously name antimicrobial correctly, and many thought that other medicines such as paracetamol and mist expectorant sedative were antimicrobials. The term "antibiotic" is an alien concept to most members of the local community, shown by the lack of a similar word in Kiswahili; the word "antibayotiki" has been adapted from English. People tend to comprehend modern or Western concept of diseases and medicines through their own local understanding, known as a local explanatory model [20,21],by mixing local/traditional and modern medical concepts [1]. This phenomenon might explain some of the respondents' misconceptions about, where some thought that mist expectorant sedative is an antimicrobial and that antimicrobials can be used to treat watery diarrhea and cold and coughs. The misconception might also result from people's inability to discern the difference between symptoms and disease, for example, when they observe doctors prescribing amoxicillin and mist expectorant sedative interchangeably or together to "treat" a cough.

Community understanding of the concept of AMR was better. A quarter of the respondents knew of serious AMR issues related to tuberculosis and sexually transmitted infections; however, one-third knew about serious resistance against antiretroviral drugs, perhaps because of large investments to raise awareness about HIV/AIDS. In addition, the Kiswahili term "usugu" can be translated to mean resistance, but can also mean chronic disease. Because HIV/AIDS is a chronic disease, respondents could translate "usugu" as that instead of as resistance to drugs. The largest proportion of respondents reported awareness of resistance against malaria parasites, which might be explained by the previous decade' strong public campaigns related to the resistance of chloroquine and sulfadoxine-pyrimethamine and the shift to the newly recommended artemisinin-based combination therapy.

We found that the level of knowledge of antimicrobials and AMR decreased if respondents lived further from an ADDO and where ADDO density was lower. This may support the important role that ADDO providers and the program in general play in communicating the correct information about antimicrobials and AMR to the community. Tanzanian drug sellers reportedly have a better understanding of antimicrobials and AMR compared to the general population [22,23], which may be attributed to the ADDO training that includes, among other things, rational medicines use and counselling [24]. In addition, most ADDO dispensers are nurse assistants with one year of health training, which could have increased their medicine knowledge.

We expected that regions with a longer-running ADDO program would have a higher proportion of household respondents with the correct knowledge of antimicrobials and AMR. However, our findings showed that although Morogoro region started much earlier it did not excel over the other three regions. In fact, after the initial ADDO training, there has not been any continuing education for dispensers. Furthermore, anecdotal evidence indicates that the accreditation that the ADDO dispensers receive motivates them to seek better-paying jobs in urban areas. Thus, replacement of trained with untrained providers may have compromised the level of knowledge in regions with long-standing programs. Recently, however, training institutions located in each of Tanzania's seven zones have begun offering regular ADDO dispenser training, which will help ensure a consistent supply of trained people [7].

#### **Methodological Considerations**

In this study, we did not weight the data; hence, comparisons between regions require caution given the large population size differences. In addition, the interpretation of the term "resistance" to mean disease chronicity might have led to over-reporting of AMR knowledge for conditions such as HIV/AIDS. Because respondents were likely to include all types of antimicrobials while

responding questions related to antibiotics, we considered all antimicrobials and diseases treated by antimicrobial drugs as correct responses during analysis. We made few changes to the original questions; however, the translation of concepts into Kiswahili may have affected the validity. Therefore, comparison with other countries needs to be done with caution given existing differences in local context.

# Conclusions

Tanzanians' limited knowledge of antimicrobials and AMR is likely to have negative implications for efforts to reduce the emergence of AMR, because people with a poor understanding of the related concepts are unlikely to adopt the desired behavior changes.

Strategies that lean too heavily on professional education are equally unlikely to result in large-scale or long-lasting improvement [1]. Therefore, multi-pronged strategies are needed to improve the level of information about antimicrobials, the effects of irrational use of medicines, and the dangers of AMR. For example, in addition to incorporating medicine use topics in health care provider curricula, public advocacy campaigns can encompass a variety of interventions including focusing on school-aged children[25] or patients waiting to be attended, taking advantage of the long waiting times at health facilities, and using of mass media to raise awareness in the community. Since low-socioeconomic status households and people with less formal education are more likely to have poor knowledge of AMR, the education and communication strategy should target rural remote areas and urban slums where the majority of the poor and the undereducated reside. In addition, ADDO dispensers should be used as change agents because they serve many community members due to the large number and geographic spread of shops and the frequent drug stock-outs in public facilities.

# **Supporting Information**

S1 Data. PLoS One Summary.dta. (DTA)S2 Data. PLoS One Summary.do.

(DO)

**S1** Questionnaire. Household Survey on Medicines Use and Knowledge of AMR. (DOCX)

### Acknowledgments

We wish to acknowledge Dr. Edmund Rutta, Mr. Keith Johnson, Dr. Suleiman Kimatta, and Mr. Jafary Liana for their participation in the design of the study and help with logistics arrangements.

# **Author Contributions**

Conceptualization: DS DK IS AK ME. Data curation: DS DK IS. Formal analysis: DS DK IS. Funding acquisition: IS. Investigation: DS DK IS AK ME. Methodology: DS DK IS AK.

Project administration: IS ME.

Resources: DS DK IS AK.

Software: DS DK IS AK.

Supervision: DS.

Validation: DS DK IS.

Visualization: DS DK IS AK.

Writing - original draft: DS.

Writing - review & editing: DS DK IS AK ME.

#### References

- Okeke IN, Laxminarayan R, Bhutta ZA, Duse AG, Jenkins P, O' Brien TF, et al. Antimicrobial resistance in developing countries. Part I: recent trends and current status. Lancet Infect Dis. 2005; 5 (8):481–93. doi: 10.1016/S1473-3099(05)70189-4 PMID: 16048717
- Radyowijati A, Haak H. Improving antibiotic use in low-income countries: an overview of evidence on determinants. Soc Sci Med. 2003; 57(4):733–44. doi: 10.1016/s0277-9536(02)00422-7 PMID: 12821020
- 3. Taylor J, Hafner M, Yerushalmi E, Smith R, Bellasio J, Vardavas R, et al. Estimating the economic costs of antimicrobial resistance: model and results. Cambridge UK: RAND Europe; 2014.
- 4. World Health Organization. Antimicrobial resistance. Fact sheet N°194. Geneva: WHO; 2015.
- Global Antibiotic Resistance Partnership—Tanzania Working Group. Situation Analysis and Recommendations: Antibiotic Use and Resistance in Tanzania. Washington, DC and New Delhi: Center for Disease Dynamics, Economics & Policy;2015.
- Wafula FN, Miriti EM, Goodman CA. Examining characteristics, knowledge and regulatory practices of specialized drug shops in Sub-Saharan Africa: a systematic review of the literature. BMC Health Serv Res 2012 12:223. doi: 10.1186/1472-6963-12-223 PMID: 22838649
- Rutta E, Liana J, Embrey M, Johnson K, Kimatta S, Valimba R, et al. Accrediting retail drug shops to strengthen Tanzania's public health system: an ADDO case study. J Pharm Policy Pract. 2015; 8 (1):23. doi: 10.1186/s40545-015-0044-4 PMID: 26413304
- Hongoro C, Kumaranayake L. Do they work? Regulating for-profit providers in Zimbabwe. Health Policy Plan. 2000; 15(4):368–77. doi: 10.1093/heapol/15.4.368 PMID: 11124239
- Chalker JC, Vialle-Valentin C, Liana J, Mbwasi R, Semali AI, Kihiyo B, et al. What roles do accredited drug dispensing outlets in Tanzania play in facilitating access to antimicrobials? Results of a multimethod analysis. Antimicrob Resist Infect Control. 2015; 4:33. doi: 10.1186/s13756-015-0075-2 PMID: 26301089
- Dillip A, Embrey M, Shekalaghe E, Ross-Degnan D, Vialle-Valentin D, Kimatta S, Liana J, Rutta E, Valimba R, Chalker J. What motivates antibiotic dispensing in accredited drug dispensing outlets in Tanzania? A qualitative study. Antimicrob Resist Infect Control. 2015; 4:30. doi: 10.1186/s13756-015-0073-4 PMID: 26199723
- National Bureau of Statistics. 2012 Population and Housing Census: Population Distribution by Administrative Units; Key Findings. Dar es Salaam: NBS and OCGS; 2013.
- 12. World Health Organization. WHO Household Survey to Measure Access to and Use of Medicines— Long Version: Instructions for Data Collection in Jordan. Geneva: WHO; 2009. Available: http://www. who.int/medicines/areas/coordination/data\_collection\_manual\_jordan\_2009.pdf.
- 13. MSH/Rational Pharmaceutical Management Plus and Macro International, Inc. Antimicrobial Resistance Module for Population-Based Surveys. Arlington, VA: Management Sciences for Health; 2008. Available: http://www.dhsprogram.com/What-We-Do/Survey-Types/upload/AMR\_Mod\_8\_5\_8\_ FINAL.pdf.
- Viberg N., Kalala W., Mujinja P., Tomson G., & Lundborg C. S. "Practical knowledge" and perceptions of antibiotics and antibiotic resistance among drug sellers in Tanzanian private drugstores. BMC Infect Dis. 2010; 10: 270. doi: 10.1186/1471-2334-10-270 PMID: 20846407

- 15. National Bureau of Statistics (NBS) [Tanzania] and ICF Macro. Tanzania Demographic and Health Survey 2010. Dar es Salaam, Tanzania: NBS and ICF Macro; 2011.
- Napolitano F, Izzo MT, Di Giuseppe G, Angelillo IF. Public knowledge, attitudes, and experience regarding the use of antibiotics in Italy. PLoS ONE. 2013; 8(12):e84177. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone. 0084177 PMID: 24376793
- Yu M, Zhao G, Stålsby Lundborg C, Zhu Y, Zhao Q, Xu B. Knowledge, attitudes, and practices of parents in rural China on the use of antibiotics in children: a cross-sectional study. BMC Infect Dis. 2014 27; 14:112. doi: 10.1186/1471-2334-14-112 PMID: 24576064
- Vallin M, Polyzoi M, Marrone G, Rosales-Klintz S, Tegmark Wisell K, Stålsby Lundborg C. Knowledge and attitudes towards antibiotic use and resistance—a latent class analysis of a Swedish populationbased sample. PLoS ONE. 2016; 11(4):e0152160. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0152160. eCollection 2016 PMID: 27096751
- National Bureau of Statistics [Tanzania]. Key Findings 2011 /12 Household Budget Survey Tanzania Mainland. Dar es Salaam: NBS and Ministry of Finance; November 2013.
- Haak H, Hardon A. Indigenised pharmaceuticals in developing countries: widely used, widely neglected. Lancet. 1988; 2(8611):620–1. PMID: 2900991
- 21. Sachs G, Tomson G. Medicines and culture—a double perspective on drug utilization in a developing country. Soc Sci Med. 1992; 3(34):307–15.
- 22. Viberg N, Mijinja P, Kalala W, Kumaranayake L, Vyas S, Tomson G, et al. STI management in Tanzania private drug stores—practices and roles of drug sellers. Sex Transm Infect. 2009; doi: 10.1136/sti. 2008.032888
- Valimba R, Liana J, Joshi MP, Rutta E, Embrey M, Bundala M, et al. Engaging the private sector to improve antimicrobial use in the community: experience from accredited drug dispensing outlets in Tanzania. J Pharm policy Pract [Internet]. 2014; 7(1):11. Available: <u>http://www.joppp.org/content/7/1/ 11. doi: 10.1186/2052-3211-7-11</u> PMID: 25298887
- Rutta D, Senauer K, Johnson K, Adeya G, Mbwasi R, Liana J, et al. Creating a new class of pharmaceutical services provider for underserved areas: the Tanzania accredited drug dispensing outlet experience. Prog Community Health Partners. 2009; 3(2): 145–53. doi: 10.1353/cpr.0.0063 PMID: 20208262
- Lecky DM, McNulty CA, Adriaenssens N, Koprivová Herotová T, Holt J, Touboul P, et al. What are school children in Europe being taught about hygiene and antibiotic use? J Antimicrob Chemother. 2011; 66 (Suppl 5):v13–21. doi: 10.1093/jac/dkr120 PMID: 21680582